

## APLU Task Force on Tenure, Promotion, and Technology Transfer Survey Results and Next Steps

### Background & Purpose of Survey

In fall 2014, APLU created a Task Force on Tenure, Promotion, and Technology Transfer (TPTT) to study the role of technology transfer in faculty personnel decisions. The charge of the TPTT Task Force is to provide recommendations on appropriate consideration of technology transfer in faculty tenure and promotion reviews, including broadening of criteria and guidance for how faculty reviews should weigh and assess technology transfer activities and their quality and impact.

To provide information to the task force on the current practices among APLU members, a short survey was distributed to 204 chief academic affairs officers from U.S. and Canadian universities in November and December of 2014. The survey included questions on policies and practices for the evaluation of technology transfer activities within the promotion and tenure process. Respondents were also asked to provide text or links concerning written policies in this area. Tech transfer was broadly defined as “entrepreneurship, innovation, and technology-based economic development activities.”

### Summary of Survey Results

The survey was completed by 51 university officials from 45 institutions for a response rate of 22%. 91% of the responses came from research universities and 36% were from AAU research institutions. A summary of survey results are given below. Complete results from the survey can be found in the Appendices, including a list of participating institutions, responses by question and institution type, and a summary of excerpts from the written policies.

- **Use of tech transfer in promotion and tenure.** Overall, 91% of respondents (40 institutions) indicated that tech transfer activities were considered within the tenure and promotion process. Of the 40 institutions, 26 indicated the activities could be considered by any area or unit, while 14 indicated that the consideration was limited to some areas or units.
- **Use by academic discipline.** Academic disciplines in which tech transfer was used the most often as part of the tenure and promotion process were biological and biomedical sciences (79%), engineering (64%), and computer and information sciences (64%). Overall STEM-related areas made the most use of tech transfer.
- **Activities considered.** The tech transfer activities considered the most often were domestic patents issued (91%), intellectual contribution to the field (88%), and industrially sponsored research funding (88%), as well as technology-related grants/contract (85%).
- **Importance of including tech transfer activities.** No respondents indicated that including tech transfer activities within the promotion and tenure process was “very important.” 21% indicated including tech transfer activities were “important” and 59% of respondents rated the inclusion “somewhat important.” 21% responded with “somewhat unimportant” or “very unimportant.”

- **Timing of policy implementation.** About 41% of respondents have had policies in place since 2005 or earlier. 33% of respondents did not know when their policies were implemented.

Of the 22 comments provided by the survey respondents, about one quarter revealed a positive attitude toward the inclusion of tech transfer activities within promotion and tenure, for example: *“The importance of these activities is explicitly recognized as a value-added component to an individual’s tenure and/or promotion application.”* While another quarter of the comments showed an emerging positive recognition of the value of such activities. The remaining half of the comments suggested a more neutral attitude indicating such activities fell under the broad umbrella of “research” or the priority decisions were left to the department.

### Conclusions and Next Steps

In sum, the results of the survey indicate that many APLU institutions consider “entrepreneurship, innovation, and technology-based economic development activities” as part of the promotion and/or tenure evaluation process for faculty, particularly faculty in STEM-related areas. However, with a few exceptions, most universities do not place a high value on such activities or actively encourage (or incentivize) faculty to pursue entrepreneurially-driven research. Although these conclusions should be interpreted with some caution given the limited number of APLU institutions responding to the survey (45 of 204, the results are consistent with recent work done by Sandberg, et al (2014)<sup>1</sup>. Sandberg’s work also found universities slow to embrace their new central role in providing innovation, technology transfer, and entrepreneurship to a knowledge-centered economy. The authors argue this is due in part to the lack of incentives for faculty.

The APLU Task Force on Tenure, Promotion, and Technology Transfer could bring wider recognition to the importance of tech transfer activities within the university research mission through recommendations that faculty promotion and tenure policies and practices more explicitly include, evaluate, and create incentives for such work.

---

<sup>1</sup> Sandberg, P.R., et al. (May 2014). Changing the academic culture: Valuing patents and commercialization toward tenure and career advancement. PNAS Perspectives, [www.pnas.org/cgi/content/short/1404094111](http://www.pnas.org/cgi/content/short/1404094111).

## Appendix A: University Respondents by Name, Institution Type, State

### List of University Respondents (Question 1)

Ball State University	The University of Texas at San Antonio	University of Nevada, Las Vegas
California Polytechnic State University	United States Naval Academy	University of North Carolina Wilmington
Central State University	University of Arizona	University of North Dakota
Colorado State University	University of Arkansas	University of Oregon
Georgia Southern University	University of California Irvine	University of Pittsburgh
Georgia State University	University of Colorado Boulder	University of Rhode Island
Iowa State University	University of Illinois at Chicago	University of South Carolina
Louisiana State University	University of Iowa	University of South Florida
Massachusetts Institute of Technology	University of Kansas	University of Washington
Mississippi State University	University of Kentucky	University of Wisconsin-Madison
Northern Arizona University	University of Louisiana at Lafayette	Utah State University
Ohio University	University of Maryland	Virginia Tech
Portland State University	University of Minnesota-Twin Cities	Western Michigan University
South Carolina State University	University of Missouri	Western University of Ontario
Texas A&M University	University of Montana	
The Pennsylvania State University		

**Summary Table by Carnegie Classifications**

<b>Modified Carnegie Classification</b>	<b>University Count</b>	<b>University Percent</b>
Masters and Baccalaureate Institutions	4	9%
Research Institutions	41	91%
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>100%</b>

**Summary Table by AAU Membership**

<b>AAU Status</b>	<b>University Count</b>	<b>University Percent</b>
AAU	36	36%
Non-AAU	29	64%
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>45</b>	<b>100%</b>

**Summary of Respondents by State/Province**

<b>State/Province</b>	<b>Count</b>	<b>State/Province</b>	<b>Count</b>	<b>State/Province</b>	<b>Count</b>
AR	1	MA	1	OR	2
AZ	2	MD	2	PA	2
CA	2	MI	1	RI	1
CO	2	MN	1	SC	2
FL	1	MO	1	TX	2
GA	2	MS	1	UT	1
IA	2	MT	1	VA	1
IL	1	NC	1	WA	1
IN	1	ND	1	WI	1
KS	1	NV	1	<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>45</b>
KY	1	OH	2		
LA	2	Ont	1		

## Appendix B: Responses by Question, Institution Type

### Question 2: Does your university consider entrepreneurship, innovation, or technology-based economic development as part of the promotion and tenure process?

Modified Carnegie Classification	Count of Responses	Percent of Responses
<b>Masters and Baccalaureate Institutions</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>9%</b>
Yes, these activities can be considered by any area or unit as appropriate.	1	2%
Yes, but consideration is limited to some areas or units.	0	0%
No, but the practice is currently being reviewed.	1	2%
No, the practice is not under review.	2	5%
<b>Research Institutions</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>91%</b>
Yes, these activities can be considered by any area or unit as appropriate.	25	57%
Yes, but consideration is limited to some areas or units.	14	32%
No, but the practice is currently being reviewed.	0	0%
No, the practice is not under review.	1	2%
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>100%</b>

**Question 3: Select the areas or units that evaluate entrepreneurship, innovation, or technology-based economic development activities as part of the promotion and tenure review process.  
(check all that apply) (N=14)**

<b>Field</b>	<b>Masters and Baccalaureate Institutions</b>	<b>Research Institutions</b>	<b>Percent of Total</b>
Agriculture		1	7%
Architecture		1	7%
Arts		3	21%
Biological and Biomedical Sciences		11	79%
Business, Management, Marketing		5	36%
Computer, Information Sciences		9	64%
Education		3	21%
Engineering		9	64%
Health Professions, Medicine		5	36%
Humanities		1	7%
Mathematics, Statistics		2	14%
Physical Sciences		8	57%
Public Administration, Social Services		0	0%
Social Sciences		3	21%
Other (please specify)		2	14%
<b>Total</b>		<b>63</b>	

**Question 4: What types of entrepreneurial, innovation, or technology-based economic development activities are considered or evaluated within the promotion and tenure process? (Check all that apply)  
(N=40)**

<b>Type of Innovation Activity</b>	<b>Masters and Baccalaureate Institutions</b>		<b>Research Institutions</b>	
Licenses executed	1	3%	26	65%
License income received			12	30%
Domestic patent application filed	1	3%	27	68%
Domestic patent disclosure submitted			25	63%
Domestic patent issued	1	3%	35	88%
Third party awards/honors	1	3%	26	65%
Industrially sponsored research funding	1	3%	34	85%
Foreign patent issued			23	58%
Copyrights issued			20	50%
Technology-related grants/contract	1	3%	33	83%
Skills/knowledge taught to students	1	3%	29	73%
Intellectual contribution to the field	1	3%	34	85%
Companies started			16	40%
Technology transferred	1	3%	29	73%
Other (please specify)			1	3%
Technical assistance to external organization	1	3%	25	63%
<b>Total</b>	<b>10</b>		<b>395</b>	

**Question 5: What year were entrepreneurship, innovation, or technology-based economic development activities included within the promotion and tenure process? (N=39)**

<b>Carnegie Status</b>	<b>Count of Carnegie Classification</b>	<b>Percent Carnegie Classification</b>
<b>Masters and Baccalaureate Institutions</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>3%</b>
2005 or earlier	1	3%
<b>Research Institutions</b>	<b>38</b>	<b>97%</b>
2008	1	3%
2009	1	3%
2010	2	5%
2012	1	3%
2013	3	8%
2014	1	3%
2005 or earlier	1	3%
Unknown	15	38%
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>39</b>	<b>100%</b>

**Question 6: Rate the relative importance of entrepreneurship, innovation,  
or technology-based economic development within the promotion and tenure process at your  
university. (N=40)**

<b>Carnegie Classification</b>	<b>Count</b>	<b>Percent</b>
<b>Masters and Baccalaureate Institutions</b>	<b>1</b>	<b>2%</b>
Very important	0	0%
Important	0	0%
Somewhat important	1	2%
Somewhat unimportant	0	0%
Very unimportant	0	0%
<b>Research Institutions</b>	<b>39</b>	<b>98%</b>
Very important	0	0%
Important	8	20%
Somewhat important	23	58%
Somewhat unimportant	7	18%
Very unimportant	1	2%
<b>Grand Total</b>	<b>40</b>	<b>100%</b>

### Appendix C: Additional Comments from Survey Respondents

Please add any comments regarding the inclusion or importance of entrepreneurship, innovation, or technology-based economic development activities as part of promotion and tenure.		
1	As noted above, what is included depends on the appropriateness for each academic unit. There is considerable variation across campus.	neutral
2	At Western the activities that faculty engage in are defined in the article 'Academic Responsibilities of Members' of the faculty collective agreement, and their performance of these responsibilities is evaluated through the procedures defined in the article 'Annual Performance Evaluation' and the article 'Promotion and Tenure'. The latter two documents are written to be permissive of recognition of activities falling under entrepreneurship, innovation, or technology based economic development, while not mentioning them specifically, or requiring them. Rather what is recognized, and the weight that is attached, is left up to local determination in each academic department. So, for example, in Engineering the local practice is that patents are recognized as a valued outcome of research activity, and amount of royalties earned would be recognized as a measure of the impact of the research outcomes. In the Business School case writing would be a recognized activity and the sales of the cases would be recognized as a measure of their impact.	neutral
3	Currently working with departments to build engagement with our 'inclusive view of scholarship' because our COACHE survey results show that the departmental perspective on such issues sets the baseline for the entire process and is essential to the broader cultural changes that our revisions are intended to drive.	positive
4	Entrepreneurship, innovation and technology transfer contributions are typically considered under the rubric of research, scholarship, and creative work within the tenure and promotion review process.	neutral
5	For units that include entrepreneurship as part of the research mission, it is becoming a more important area for consideration. However, it is not a requirement at the level of University Regulations.	trending positive
6	In 2013, our Vice President for Research created an office of Technology Transfer and we have worked closely with them. We have not formalized the specific evaluation standards for faculty for this work yet in large part because we've had relatively [little] faculty activity in this area in the past. Moving forward we think it will be particularly important for our university because we are the only research university in a region with an economy and leading industry much in need of innovation (gaming, hospitality, aerial systems, health care, etc)	trending positive
7	In the units identified in the previous question, these activities are frequently listed among a number of others (and frankly, towards the end of a long list) that constitute evidence for scholarly productivity. Compared to peer-reviewed publications, presentations and competitive external funding, their importance is significantly less. They may have an effect however, in 'border-line' cases.	slight negative

Please add any comments regarding the inclusion or importance of entrepreneurship, innovation, or technology-based economic development activities as part of promotion and tenure.		
8	Individual departments also have tenure and promotion statements that will exceed the general criteria of the tenure policy and those departments will have more specific criteria addressing the relative weight of entrepreneurship, innovation, and technology transfer.	neutral
9	It is clear that our university could increase the transparency of inclusion of these aspects in the P and T process.	
10	It is still a relatively young area of consideration for P&T and there have not been any prominent instances yet of it being a decisive factor in our deliberations.	neutral
11	<p>Most of the references to activities or accomplishments related to innovation and entrepreneurship as they apply to tenure and promotion actions on our campus occur in the Retention, Promotion, and Tenure documents at the college and/or department level. The university-wide document refers to research and scholarly activity, teaching, and service generally, without detail. That document is also tied to the California state-wide faculty collective bargaining agreement, and therefore applies to all 23 campuses in the CSU (many of which have a less significant focus on research and entrepreneurship).</p> <p>Because we are a polytechnic university and also have a Center for Innovation and Entrepreneurship as well as a Tech Park, we have a lot of emphasis on applied and basic research, as well as entrepreneurial activity. These are highly valued and find expression in RPT documents in many colleges and departments. We also have a number of very active Centers and Institutes which focus on technology, innovation, contract work, and related items. These are highly valued and very often engage faculty members from multiple disciplines.</p>	positive
12	Tenure at the University of Oregon is the result of accumulated accomplishments in research, teaching, and service, when together they indicate the potential for an enduring career of academic excellence. We consider excellence in research to mean research that leads to a national and international reputation for creating new knowledge in one's field. Excellence in teaching means excellence in fostering learning at all levels of instruction, both undergraduate and graduate. Excellence in service means service sufficient to establish one's ability and commitment to participate in the success of the university, one's academic field, and the communities in which those are situated. Specific Promotion and Tenure criteria vary from department to department.	neutral
13	The importance of these activities is explicitly recognized as a value added component to an individual's tenure and/or promotion application. The university seeks a balance of activities, but realizes that special prominence may be gained in one or more activity compared to others, including the activities discussed here, that significantly enhance the quality of the application.	positive

Please add any comments regarding the inclusion or importance of entrepreneurship, innovation, or technology-based economic development activities as part of promotion and tenure.		
14	The primary consideration is in the general term 'innovation.' Many units reward innovation in teaching in their P&T processes, and I am uncertain if that is the meaning of 'innovation' that your survey is after. I do not find instances of rewarding the other components of the study, so I suspect this is not what you are seeking.	neutral
15	The University of Arkansas has identified entrepreneurship and innovation as an important component of our university outreach. They have been added to our promotion and tenure documents to stress the university's perspective of their importance.	positive
16	These are included as one measure of impact of scholarly and creative activity.	neutral
17	These considerations are growing in importance. They began in different departments in different years but began after 2005. No specifics are in the Promotion and tenure guidelines but individual departments consider these when viewing individual cases based on faculty job descriptions.	trending positive
18	They are included to the extent the unit uses them to evaluate research and scholarship as well as engagement. They are not explicitly encouraged or prioritized in the P&T standards.	neutral
19	This area continues to evolve and is receiving increased attention from our new president. As you might expect, some of our colleges are further along this path than others.	trending positive
20	We are very interested in the impact that our faculty members have on the world, frequently seek letters from industry, include descriptions of patents and start-ups as part of the promotion and tenure package, etc.	positive
21	We do not have university-wide promotion and tenure criteria. Some departments have broadly defined criteria that do not explicitly state innovation/commercialization activity but nonetheless can and do accommodate credit for such activity. Faculty interest in these activities is growing and faculty are increasingly willing to credit these items in the promotion and tenure process. Faculty culture is as or more important than written criteria in determining the weight given to entrepreneurship/commercialization activity in promotion and tenure reviews.	trending positive
22	We see this as a growing area of scholarship, especially with our focus on entrepreneurship and innovation. It will complement published scholarly work, which will long remain the major consideration along with teaching and service/outreach.	trending positive

**Appendix D: Language Used in Promotion and Tenure Policies to Recognize Tech Transfer Activities**

The table below includes links and resource examples provided by the survey respondents as well as language examples quoted from the university policies or guidelines referenced by respondents.

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
<b>Ball State University</b>	Research Universities (high research activity)	These variations are represented across 47 promotion and tenure documents as scholarly or intellectual works.	<p>From the University Promotion and Tenure Document:</p> <p><i>Recommendations shall be supported by ample documentary evidence demonstrating that the candidate for promotion satisfies established criteria. Documentation shall include: scholarship, creative endeavors, and other scholarly productivity.</i></p>
<b>Colorado State University</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)		<p>E.12.2 Research and Other Creative Activity (last revised August 12, 2009)</p> <p><i>Research is the discovery and development of knowledge; other creative activity is original or imaginative accomplishment. Research and other creative activity include, but are not limited to, publications; exhibitions, presentations or performances; copyrighted, patented or licensed works and inventions; supervision of or assistance with graduate student theses/dissertations and undergraduate research; and the award of funding to support research and other creative activities. Scholarly activities that advance the effectiveness of teaching and education could also be considered research.</i></p> <p><i>The criteria for evaluating the original or imaginative nature of research and other creative activities should be the generally accepted standards prevailing in the applicable discipline or professional area. Standards for determining quality will vary among disciplines and should be specified by</i></p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
			<p><i>each academic unit. However, evaluations should be based primarily upon the quality of the product as judged by peers. Some measures of quality are the prestige of the journals in which publications appear, reviews of publications in the critical literature, reviews of artistic performance by recognized experts, prizes and other awards for significant professional accomplishment, grants obtained in open competition, and impact and outcome assessments as indicated by adoption of results by clientele..</i></p>
<p><b>Iowa State University</b></p>	<p>Research Universities (very high research activity)</p>	<p>"See sections 5.2.2.4 and 5.2.2.5 of the ISU Faculty Handbook, pages 58-59. <a href="http://www.provost.iastate.edu/sites/default/files/uploads/fh/Faculty%20Handbook%20-%20January%202015%20final.pdf">http://www.provost.iastate.edu/sites/default/files/uploads/fh/Faculty%20Handbook%20-%20January%202015%20final.pdf</a></p>	<p>Research /Creative Activities: <i>Faculty members who engage in research/creative activities are expected to make original contributions that are appropriate to their chosen area of specialization and that are respected by peers within and outside the university: conceptualizing and theorizing in an original way, innovative collection or analysis of empirical data, seeking and obtaining competitive grants and contracts, and relating research to the solution of practical problems.</i></p> <p>Extension/Professional Practice <i>Extension/professional practice distinguishes Iowa State as a land-grant university. Faculty members may engage in extension/professional practice activities by utilizing their professional expertise to disseminate information outside of the traditional classroom to help improve the knowledge and skills of their clientele (i.e., the publics they serve) or the environment in which they live and work. This work should be related to the faculty member’s position responsibilities.</i></p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
			<p><i>Examples of activities that fall within extension/professional practice include the following:</i></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• <i>engaging in clinical and diagnostic practice</i></li> <li>• <i>acquiring, organizing, and interpreting information resources</i></li> <li>• <i>engaging in technology transfer</i></li> <li>• <i>consulting</i></li> <li>• <i>servicing on agencies or boards because of individual expertise</i></li> </ul> <p><i>Since extension/professional practice activities vary greatly among departments, it is the responsibility of each department to identify faculty activities that fall under this category and the appropriate evaluation methods.</i></p>
<b>Louisiana State University</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)		<p><i>Examples of scholarship that may be recognized, depending on the department, include the following: creations in the visual arts, video or other media; Development of patents, processes, or instruments; designs and built works; the delivery or application of technology.</i></p>
<b>Ohio University</b>	Research Universities (high research activity)		<p>Scholarly Achievement in Research: <i>Contribution to the Development of Research Instrumentation, Procedures, Techniques, and/or Patents that are widely recognized by peers.</i></p> <p><i>Although original publications and external grant awards will normally be the major items for consideration of research effectiveness, the following items will also be considered: patents.</i></p> <p>Heritage College of Osteopathic Medicine</p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
			<p>Research/Scholarly Activity Portfolio should include documentation of: 3. <i>Patents held or applied for.</i></p> <p><i>Russ College of Engineering and Technology Minimal Criteria for Promotion and Tenure: Research/Scholarly Accomplishment: patents received.</i></p>
<b>Texas A&amp;M University</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	<p><a href="http://policies.tamus.edu/12-02.pdf">http://policies.tamus.edu/12-02.pdf</a> <a href="#">Section 3</a></p> <p><a href="http://rules.tamu.edu/PDFs/12.01.99.M2.pdf">http://rules.tamu.edu/PDFs/12.01.99.M2.pdf</a> Section 4.4.1</p>	<p><i>Guidelines for the granting of tenure should include: Research, Creative Activities, and Other Scholarly Endeavors; Patents or Commercialization of Research, where applicable.</i></p> <p>4.4.1 Categories of Performance: <i>Creation and dissemination of new knowledge or other creative activities: For most disciplines, this category consists of research and publication. For some disciplines, however, it may include other forms of creative activity. Architectural design, engineering technology, veterinary or medical technology, fiction, poetry, painting, music, and sculpture are examples.</i></p>
<b>The Pennsylvania State University</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	<p>See pages 46-47 of the ADMINISTRATIVE GUIDELINES FOR HR-23 PROMOTION AND TENURE PROCEDURES AND REGULATIONS found at</p> <p><a href="http://www.psu.edu/dept/vprov/pdfs/p_and_t_%20guidelines.pdf">http://www.psu.edu/dept/vprov/pdfs/p_and_t_%20guidelines.pdf</a>.</p>	<p><i>Creative accomplishments: patents, new product development; new computer software programs developed; new or enhanced systems and procedures demonstrated or evaluated; technology transferred in field, evidence of impact in society of research scholarship and creative accomplishments.</i></p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
<b>The University of Texas at San Antonio</b>	Research Universities (high research activity)	<p>"Mission statement: <a href="https://utsa.edu/about/mission.html">https://utsa.edu/about/mission.html</a></p> <p>University policy: <a href="http://www.utsa.edu/hop/chapter2/2-10.html">http://www.utsa.edu/hop/chapter2/2-10.html</a> , especially section V.B.3.a.v.</p> <p>P&amp;T guidelines: <a href="http://provost.utsa.edu/home/Evaluation/PromotionTenure/packet.asp">http://provost.utsa.edu/home/Evaluation/PromotionTenure/packet.asp</a>, especially Section 6."</p>	<p>Mission: <i>catalyst for socioeconomic development and commercialization of intellectual property.</i></p> <p>University policy: <i>development of intellectual property such as patents and licenses.</i></p> <p>Promotion and Tenure Guidelines for Intellectual property: <i>...provide a summary of intellectual property generated and indicate any patent applications, copyright privileges, licensing, or other commercialization that has resulted. Faculty are not required to divulge sensitive information concerning the intellectual property, but may document its development and potential commercialization through letters and other communications.</i></p>
<b>University of Arizona</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	<p>"University Handbook P&amp;T Criteria: <a href="http://hr.arizona.edu/policy/appointed-personnel/3.3.02">http://hr.arizona.edu/policy/appointed-personnel/3.3.02</a></p> <p>Supporting documentation: <a href="http://facultyaffairs.arizona.edu/promoting-inclusive-view-scholarship">http://facultyaffairs.arizona.edu/promoting-inclusive-view-scholarship</a>"</p>	<p><i>b. Criteria</i></p> <p><i>Promotion and tenure require excellent performance and the promise of continued excellence in 1) teaching, 2) service, and 3) research, creative work, and scholarship. The University values an inclusive view of scholarship in the recognition that knowledge is acquired and advanced through discovery, integration, application, and teaching. Given this perspective, promotion and tenure reviews, as detailed in the criteria of individual departments and colleges, will recognize original research contributions in peer-reviewed publications as well as integrative and applied forms of scholarship that involve cross-cutting collaborations with business and community partners, including translational research, commercialization activities, and patents.</i></p> <p><i>UHAP Chapter 4A.3.02.1 states: continuing status requires excellent performance and the promise of continued</i></p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
			<p><i>excellence in the candidate’s assigned duties, which may include teaching, outreach, service, and research, creative work, and scholarship. The University values an inclusive view of scholarship in the recognition that knowledge is acquired and advanced through discovery, integration, application, and teaching. Given this perspective, continuing status and promotion reviews, as detailed in the criteria of individual units, departments, and colleges, will recognize a wide range of original research-based contributions in peer-reviewed publications as well as integrative and applied forms of scholarship that involve cross-cutting collaborations with business and community partners, including translational research, commercialization activities, and patents.</i></p>
<p><b>University of Arkansas</b></p>	<p>Research Universities (very high research activity)</p>	<p><a href="http://fulbright.uark.edu/facultystaff/documents/2013/FacultyReviewChecklistrevised4-19-13.pdf">http://fulbright.uark.edu/facultystaff/documents/2013/FacultyReviewChecklistrevised4-19-13.pdf</a></p>	<p><i>Other activities: Describe all contributions and innovations for curriculum, course, and program development.</i></p> <p><i>Professional Performance: innovations in program implementation; evidence of the development of special projects, resource tools, and (or) the use of creative techniques in the performance of duties.</i></p> <p><i>Research, Publication, and Creative Activity; other kinds of professional activity; Intellectual Property</i></p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> <li><i>1. Supply information relative to patents awarded.</i></li> <li><i>2. Supply information relative to patent applications filed.</i></li> <li><i>3. Supply patent number.</i></li> </ol> <p><i>Provide information concerning other kinds of professional service (for example, adult education and extension work, outreach and executive education programs, and community service – if performed as a representative of the University).</i></p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
<b>University of California Irvine</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	<p>7. Academic Personnel Manual section 210, Appointment and Promotion, Review and Appraisal Committees [see sections 210-1-d (2) and (3)]</p> <p><a href="http://www.ucop.edu/academic-personnel-programs/files/apm/apm-210.pdf">http://www.ucop.edu/academic-personnel-programs/files/apm/apm-210.pdf</a></p>	<p><i>(2) Research and Creative Work — Evidence of a productive and creative mind should be sought in the candidate’s published research or recognized artistic production in original architectural or engineering designs, or the like.</i></p> <p><i>(3) Professional Competence and Activity — In certain positions in the professional schools and colleges, such as architecture, business administration, dentistry, engineering, law, medicine, etc., a demonstrated distinction in the special competencies appropriate to the field and its characteristic activities should be recognized as a criterion for appointment or promotion. The candidate’s professional activities should be scrutinized for evidence of achievement and leadership in the field and of demonstrated progressiveness in the development or utilization of new approaches and techniques for the solution of professional problems, including those that specifically address the professional advancement of individuals in underrepresented groups in the candidate’s field.</i></p>
<b>University of Illinois at Chicago</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	<p>The forms required for application for promotion and tenure prompt the opportunity to report patents, copy-written materials, training activities, consultation and entrepreneurship, and a range of grants and awards, including those involving private industry:</p> <p><a href="http://www.uic.edu/depts/oa/pt.html">http://www.uic.edu/depts/oa/pt.html</a></p>	

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
<b>University of Kentucky</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	<p><a href="http://www.uky.edu/Faculty/Senate/rules_regulations/Index.htm">www.uky.edu/Faculty/Senate/rules_regulations/Index.htm</a></p> <p>This website includes all of the current statements of evidence for promotion and tenure by individual disciplines that are handled at the unit level.</p>	
<b>University of Maryland, College Park</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	<p>New language, added in 2014, to the university's Appointment, Promotion, and Tenure Policy:</p>	<p>Appointment, Promotion, and Tenure Policy <i>Scholarship, research, and creative activities include the discovery, integration, transmission and engagement of knowledge through systematic inquiry that advances specific fields/disciplines and contributes to the public good.</i></p> <p><i>Scholarship includes original contributions to relevant disciplines, and may include newer forms such as engaged scholarship, public scholarship, entrepreneurial projects, and interdisciplinary research, regardless of the medium of publication or execution. Scholarship may also include work in fields that are not yet fully formed, such as attention to populations that have not been previously investigated or previously unexplored phenomena. For all scholarship, research and creative activities, the work must call upon the faculty member's academic and/or professional expertise, and will be evaluated based on the unit's criteria for excellence, including: peer review, impact, and significance and/or innovation."</i></p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
<b>University of Minnesota, Twin Cities</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)	Section 7.11 of the University of Minnesota's tenure policy outlines the general criteria for tenure at the institution. Language in this section makes explicit mention of technology transfer and other special kinds of activity.	<i>Interdisciplinary work, public engagement, international activities and initiatives, attention to questions of diversity, technology transfer, and other special kinds of professional activity by the candidate should be considered when applicable. The awarding of indefinite tenure presupposes that the candidate's record shows strong promise of his or her achieving promotion to professor.</i>
<b>University of Nevada, Las Vegas</b>	Research Universities (high research activity)	<a href="http://www.unlv.edu/provost/promotion-tenure">http://www.unlv.edu/provost/promotion-tenure</a>  Formalized guidelines forthcoming	Section 8. Research and Creative Activity  <i>8.1 Research Encouraged. All faculty members are strongly encouraged to engage in research and/or creative activity that will make them more effective in their positions within the university.</i>  <i>8.2 Academic Department Research Funding Encouraged. Department chairs should recommend departmental funding to encourage academic faculty members in undertaking research and/or creative activity.</i>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
<p><b>University of Pittsburgh</b></p>	<p>Research Universities (very high research activity)</p>	<p>One example is appended.</p> <p>MEDICINE. Note that 1) patents are included as evidence of innovative contributions in the Executive Summary of dossiers for the School of Medicine</p> <p><a href="http://www.medfaculty.pitt.edu/library/appointment/portfolio-submission-tenure/portfolio-prepare.php">http://www.medfaculty.pitt.edu/library/appointment/portfolio-submission-tenure/portfolio-prepare.php</a></p> <p>and that (2) the number of patents is included on the summary sheet</p> <p><a href="http://www.medfaculty.pitt.edu/documents/tfpa.form.pdf">http://www.medfaculty.pitt.edu/documents/tfpa.form.pdf</a></p>	
<p><b>University of South Florida</b></p>	<p>Research Universities (very high research activity)</p>	<p>Performance is evaluated specifically in the areas of teaching and learning, research/ creative/scholarly activity, and service.</p> <p>Technology Transfer Office and USF Connect: USF CONNECT focuses on the needs of Tampa Bay’s technology and bio/life sciences entrepreneurs; The USF Research Foundation, a not-for-profit, direct-support organization (DSO), owns and operates the USF Research Park of Tampa Bay. The Research Foundation also administers USF CONNECT, the Tampa Bay Technology Incubator (TBTI), and the</p>	<p><i>Research/Creative/Scholarly Work. Scholarship takes many forms, including independently conducted research and/or creative works and collaboratively generated contributions to the knowledge base, community improvement or the arts. These activities in various disciplines across the University of South Florida units range from research (creation and attainment of new knowledge, whether basic or applied) to creation of artistic products. The purpose of research and creative scholarship is the substantive advancement of a field of inquiry or practice, whether by generation of new knowledge or production of new creative works and technologies.</i></p> <p><i>It is noted that in some areas of scholarship, publications or other products may appear only after lengthy or extensive effort and may appear in a wider range of venues, both of</i></p>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
		Florida High Tech Corridor Council matching-grant program on behalf of the University.	<i>which can be particularly true of community-engaged and/or interdisciplinary work at the local, national and/or international levels. Community-engaged scholarship may be demonstrated by high-profile products such as reports to local, national, or international agencies and formal presentations, or by other products as designated by the unit, as well as by peer review.</i>
<b>Utah State University</b>	Research Universities (high research activity)	<a href="http://www.usu.edu/hr/files/uploads/Policies/405.pdf">http://www.usu.edu/hr/files/uploads/Policies/405.pdf</a>	USU Policy 405.2.2(2) Research or Creative Endeavors. <i>Research or creative endeavors encompass a wide variety of scholarly activities that lead to the advancement of knowledge and/or to original contributions in the arts and humanities. Documentation supporting such activities must include peer recognition of their value and may include, but is not restricted to... intellectual contributions represented by patents, inventions and other intellectual property...success in competition for extra-mural funding.</i>
<b>Virginia Tech University</b>	Research Universities (very high research activity)		<i>The promotion and tenure dossier should provide the following information about research and creative activity:</i>  <i>G. Intellectual properties. Provide insight regarding the significance of the intellectual property and its contribution to the university system (software, patents, disclosures (pre-patents).</i>
<b>Western University of Ontario</b>	Canadian (Member of U15)		<i>For the purposes of this Collective Agreement, Research, Scholarship, and Creative Activity, hereinafter for the sake of brevity referred to as "Research," involves some or all of:</i>

University	Carnegie Classification	Resources Provided by Survey Respondents	Examples of Language Quoted from University Promotion & Tenure Policies or Guidelines
			<p><i>a) the creation of new knowledge, including understanding or concepts;</i>  <i>b) the creative application of existing knowledge;</i>  <i>c) the organization and synthesis of existing knowledge;</i>  <i>d) creative expression;</i>  <i>all in whatever media are appropriate to the Member's area of academic expertise.</i></p> <p><i>The Annual Report shall contain the following: as applicable, a record of the Member's performance in the area of Research during the preceding three Academic Years. This record may include some or all of the following: a list of any other publications (e.g., patents, technical reports, case studies) reporting the Member's Research; details of any other significant activities relevant to the Member's Academic Responsibilities in the area of Research.</i></p>