APLU CIMA Commission
Niagara Falls, ON – July 13, 2015

Brian T. Prescott
Director of Policy Research, WICHE
bprescott@wiche.edu

www.wiche.edu/MLDE
Efforts to Measure Return on Investment

• HEA Reauthorization
• Gainful employment
• *Student Right to Know Before You Go Act*
• PIRS
• collegemeasures.org

*Generally, these are aimed at accountability or consumer information, with far less attention given to improvement of policy or practice.*
### Economic Success Measures - Virginia

#### College of William and Mary

**School Profile**

**Carnegie Classification:** Research Universities (High Research Activity)

**Address:** Williamsburg VA, 23187-8795

**Sector:** Public, 4-year or above

---

#### Three Most Popular Disclosable Programs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Program</th>
<th>Average First-Year Earnings (Last 5 Years)</th>
<th>% of Above-Average Earnings</th>
<th>5-Year Trend</th>
<th># of Completers</th>
<th>% of Completers with Wage Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Law [Prof.]</td>
<td>$50,000</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>▲</td>
<td>5,000</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business [BA/BS]</td>
<td>$40,000</td>
<td>10%</td>
<td>▲</td>
<td>1,000</td>
<td>20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Business [MA/MS]</td>
<td>$30,000</td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>▲</td>
<td>2,000</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

---

#### Detailed Breakdown [5 Year Data]

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Degree Level</th>
<th>Disclosable Programs</th>
<th>Average First-Year Earnings (Last 5 Years)</th>
<th>% of Above-Average Earnings</th>
<th>5-Year Trend</th>
<th># of Completers</th>
<th>% of Completers with Wage Data</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Four-Year Bachelor's Degree</td>
<td>7 disclosable programs</td>
<td>$34,571</td>
<td>11%</td>
<td>▲</td>
<td>7,125</td>
<td>22%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>First Professional Degree</td>
<td>1 disclosable programs</td>
<td>$68,572</td>
<td>17%</td>
<td>▲</td>
<td>1,018</td>
<td>29%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Master's Degree</td>
<td>5 disclosable programs</td>
<td>$65,109</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>▲</td>
<td>2,371</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Post-Master's Certificate</td>
<td>1 disclosable programs</td>
<td>$47,148</td>
<td>9%</td>
<td>{No Data}</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctor's Degree</td>
<td>1 disclosable programs</td>
<td>$54,090</td>
<td>15%</td>
<td>▲</td>
<td>310</td>
<td>39%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The Necessary Assumption

Halted at State Borders
- State policies
- Individual-level data

Not Halted at State Borders
- People
- Industries
- Firms

Requires assuming that former students who leave a state are not systematically different than those who stay.

Yet...
- Non-resident recruitment practices
- Differing choice sets for the best students at the “best” institutions
- Industries/firms are not evenly spread
Mobility

• High school to college
• During college
  – Multi-institutional attendance and online enrollment
  – In 22 states, among students who began at a public four-year institution, at least five percent of completions occurred in another state (NSC Signature Report #8 Supplement)
  – 10% of BA earners who started in a 4-year institution earned their BA in a different state (Adelman, 2004)
• Mobility post-enrollment
  – More education is related to a greater propensity to be mobile, especially in response to labor market trends (Schachter, 2004; Wozniak, 2010; others)
  – Non-natives in state labor forces routinely are better educated than natives (Colorado State Demographer, 2015)
  – Compensation varies considerably across states, even for those with the same major (Carnevale, Cheah, & Hanson, 2015)
Multistate Longitudinal Data Exchange Concept

- Other States’ Educational Institutions
- My State’s Labor Force
- Credential
- My State’s Postsecondary Institutions
- My State’s K-12 Schools
- Other States’ Labor Force
Uncertainty About Employment Outcomes Reduced by 22% in Idaho

56% of completers found in Idaho wage records

Those “not found” reduced from 44% to 35%

22% of degree completers not found in Idaho wage records were found in the other three states’ data

Notes: 3,158 students who received associate’s or higher award from an institution in Idaho by Dec. 2010 and had a valid SSN
Employment and Subsequent Enrollment Data for Idaho Awardees

Notes: 3,158 students who received associate’s or higher award from an institution in Idaho by Dec. 2010 and had a valid SSN
Quarterly Earnings Approximately 10-12 Months Post-Award (Associate’s & Higher) or Last Enrollment

With Associate’s or Higher

Without Associate’s or Higher

Notes: Wages are measured approximately a year after award, or last enrollment for those without an award.

Data apply to public high school graduates from the class of 2005 and first-time public postsecondary students in 2005-06 in HI, ID, OR, or WA who had a postsecondary enrollment record and an employment record in one or more of those states.

Source: Bransberger (2014), A Glimpse Beyond State Lines. (WICHE MLDE)
MLDE Moving Forward

• Expand to cover at least 10 states

• Enhancing usability, flexibility and articulating/demonstrating use cases

• Extending data security and privacy protections

• Building toward a sustainable resource governed/managed by states
State-Based Design & Ownership

Identity Resolution Crosswalk Table

OSPI PCHEES SBCTC WSAC ESD

ERDC

School Districts Dept. of Education HEIs

OSBE

Dept. of Labor

OEIB

HECC

OED

HI Dxp

HIDOE UH

DLIR

Multistate Longitudinal Data Exchange
Four Scoping Questions

1. How are former high school students performing in postsecondary education?

2. How are former high school students performing in the workforce?

3. How are former postsecondary students performing in the workforce?

4. How are current and former workforce participants accessing formal education systems?

Disaggregations

- Within a certain time period?
- By school/institution attended?
- By key demographics (race/ethnicity, gender)?
- By type of curriculum?
- By level of readiness?
- By departure condition (e.g., diploma, certificate, degree, not graduated, etc.)

- By characteristics of school/institution attended?
- By type of high school curriculum?
- By field of postsecondary study (CIP code)?
- By industry of employment?
- By region within state?
- By receipt of financial aid?
Summary

• Education, training, and employment are non-linear activities that are not bound by state lines; our data resources must be capable of capturing this complexity.

• Economic development depends on the labor market supply chain from both inside and outside the state.

• Data on post-enrollment employment and continuing education can and should help states and institutions improve policies and programs, not simply feed accountability or consumer information systems.

• States need a solution focused on informing their decisions while respecting their ownership of the data and ensuring data security and protecting privacy.