Holistic Admissions in the Health Professions

Greer Glazer RN, CNP, PhD, FAAN
Karen Bankston, RN, PhD
Angela Clark, RN, MSN, PhD-c
Jun Ying, PhD, Biostatistician

*Funds made available by an NIH cooperative agreement and HRSA
What is Holistic Review?

• Flexible, individualized way of assessing student applicant
  – considers students life experiences
  – personal qualities
  – traditional measures
Four Core Principles

1. Broad-based selection criteria linked to school mission and goals.

2. A balance of experiences, attributes, and academic metrics (EAM) are used, and applied equitably across the entire candidate pool.

3. Individualized consideration to how each applicant may contribute to the school and the profession.

4. Race/ethnicity may be considered.

*adapted from AAMC materials
Research Questions

• How many schools are using holistic review, and to what degree?
• What has been the impact of holistic review on diversity and student success?
Survey Process

– Completed by one person responsible for admission at each health profession school
– Primary degree programs in dentistry, medicine, pharmacy, public health and nursing
– Two-pronged approach to assessing use of holistic admission (self-reported and objective)
Reported Use

67% of schools surveyed across all health professions reported transitioning to a more holistic process over the past 10 years, while 8% said they are already using it.

75% of schools surveyed say they are currently using a holistic review process.
Extent of Use

- Many elements: 38%
- Some elements: 48%
- Few to no elements: 14%
Impact

• 72% of survey respondents reported that diversity of the incoming class increased.
• 90% of respondents reported average GPA of the incoming class was unchanged or increased.
• 96% of respondents reported graduation rates were unchanged or increased.
• 91% of respondents reported that the average number of attempts for students to pass required licensing exams remained unchanged or improved.
What about other outcomes?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Outcome</th>
<th>Outcome tracked AND school is using holistic admission</th>
<th>Outcome tracked AND school is NOT using holistic admission</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Student engagement with the community</td>
<td>64%</td>
<td>16%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cooperation and teamwork among students</td>
<td>55%</td>
<td>10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Student openness to ideas different from their own</td>
<td>50%</td>
<td>4%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Results are for all health profession schools (N=228)
Holistic Review Practices

- Evaluating applicant criteria related to specific mission or goals of the school
- Mission statement for admissions includes diversity
- Considering non-academic criteria alongside academic metrics in the initial screening process
- Selecting students from the waitlist by characteristics related to school’s mission or goals
- Providing training for the admissions committee related to school mission and/or diversity
Holistic Review Practices

• **71%** of schools that report using holistic review evaluating non-academic criteria in initial screening process

• **43%** of schools that report using holistic review say non-academic criteria are of equal importance to academic metrics during the initial screening process
HR score vs. Diversity

Mean(STD)=5.8(2.5)

p-value=0.029

Mean(STD)=6.8(2.3)
Implications

What does this mean for universities?

Universities have the potential to:

1. Increase diversity
2. Remove barriers for disadvantaged students

*University changes to the admissions process should be evidence-based*
HWCOM
Diversity & Inclusion Strategies and the Admissions Process

Cheryl D. Brewster, EdD
Assistant Dean for Diversity and Inclusion
brewstec@fiu.edu
We are the 4th largest public university in the U.S.

We are #1 in the nation for awarding bachelor’s and master’s degrees to Hispanic students.

Our current enrollment exceeds 55,000 students.

We are home to Aquarius Reef Base – the world’s only undersea research lab.

We offer more than 200 bachelor’s, master’s, and doctoral programs.

We are a leading urban public research university focused on student learning, innovation, and collaboration.

We are ranked #24 out of 277 universities in the nation based on our contribution to the public good.

We have 2 major campuses and 5 centers in South Florida.

We are ranked #1 in the nation for awarding bachelor’s and master’s degrees to Hispanic students.

- Washington Monthly
We are South Florida’s first public medical school. Our curriculum reflects an innovative, 21st century approach to health care and medical education. We achieved full accreditation by the LCME in the shortest amount of time possible. We are achieving breakthroughs in the research lab. Our residency Match rates exceed national averages. Our USMLE pass rates and mean scores exceed national averages. We are working boldly to create not just great physicians, but community leaders who think holistically, globally, and locally. - John A. Rock, MD, Founding Dean

We are ranked the 9th best medical school in the nation for Hispanics. We are achieving breakthroughs in the research lab.

We are ranked the 9th best medical school in the nation for Hispanics.
We are FIU

We are the Herbert Wertheim College of Medicine
MISSION STATEMENT

To lead the next generation of medical education and continually improve the quality of health care available to the South Florida community by:

- Training physicians to serve South Florida’s diverse population through a patient-centered curriculum instilling cultural competence,
- Providing Florida students greater access to medical education, and
- Fostering research to discover and advance medically relevant knowledge.

VISION

To be South Florida's leader in providing clinically competent physicians to the local communities, and in discovering innovations in the science and delivery of medical care.

VALUES

The conduct, ideals, and ethics that drive our operations:

- Integrity
- Scholarship
- Competence
- Nurturing
- Compassion
Green Family Foundation
NeighborhoodHELP™
What Is NeighborhoodHELP™?

A unique interdisciplinary educational model, that involves collaboration with our community partners to:

1. **Expose** medical, nursing, social work and other FIU students to the *social determinants of health*

2. **Provide** services to medically underserved communities by harnessing FIU’s educational resources through an Urban Coalition
Educational Learning Experience

Medical students connect to a household in the community for hands-on learning about:

- Social Determinants Of Health
- Multi-cultural Communities
- Interdisciplinary Team Skills
- Comprehensive Approach To Health Issues
- Framework To Manage Ethical Issues
- Cultivate Reflective Practice

Develop socially responsible, community-engaged physicians.
Green Family Foundation
NeighborhoodHELP™

From September 2010 – July 2014:

991  FIU Medical, Social Work, Nursing, and Law Students

3458  Visits to Households

542  Households participating in NeighborhoodHELP™

1242  Members in the Households

61%

Decrease in the use of Emergency Room visits as a regular place of care

26%
Panther Learning Communities

- Professional Development
- Leadership
- Community Service and Cultural Literacy
- Wellness
- Interpersonal Networking
Holistic Review

- Holistic review is a flexible, highly-individualized process by which balanced consideration is given to the multiple ways in which applicants may prepare for and demonstrate suitability as medical students and future physicians.

- Under a holistic review framework, candidates are evaluated by criteria that are institution-specific, broad-based, and mission-driven and that are applied equitably across the entire candidate pool.
Admissions 2015

Total Applications: 4289
Verified: 4130

Gender:
Male 2195 (53%)
Female 1935 (47%)

Residency:
Florida: 2066 (50%)
Out of State: 2064 (50%)

*As of 10/31/2014
Diversity

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Received</th>
<th>Academicly Ready</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Asian/Asian Indian</td>
<td>923 (22%)</td>
<td>695 (75%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>American Indian</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black/African American</td>
<td>444 (11%)</td>
<td>129 (29%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>726 (18%)</td>
<td>438 (60%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White</td>
<td>1644 (40%)</td>
<td>1300 (79%)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Other/Unknown/NR</td>
<td>393 (10%)</td>
<td>275 (70%)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Self Reported*
## Summary Enrollment Statistics

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Class of 2013</th>
<th>Class of 2014</th>
<th>Class of 2015</th>
<th>Class of 2016</th>
<th>Class of 2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Total Students</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>43</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>120</td>
<td>122</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean GPA</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean BCPM</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>3.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mean MCAT</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gender</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Males</td>
<td>(27) 63%</td>
<td>(28) 65%</td>
<td>(43) 52%</td>
<td>(60) 50%</td>
<td>(67) 55%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Females</td>
<td>(16) 37%</td>
<td>(15) 35%</td>
<td>(39) 48%</td>
<td>(60) 50%</td>
<td>(55) 45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Florida Residents</td>
<td>(34) 79%</td>
<td>(37) 86%</td>
<td>(69) 84%</td>
<td>(100) 83%</td>
<td>(97) 80%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Out-of-State</td>
<td>(9) 21%</td>
<td>(6) 14%</td>
<td>(13) 16%</td>
<td>(20) 17%</td>
<td>(25) 20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Diversity/Ethnicity</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Asian/Asian Indian</td>
<td>(10) 23%</td>
<td>(5) 12%</td>
<td>(8) 10%</td>
<td>(31) 26%</td>
<td>(22) 18%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black/African American</td>
<td>(3) 7%</td>
<td>(5) 12%</td>
<td>(9) 11%</td>
<td>(9) 8%</td>
<td>(11) 9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hispanic</td>
<td>(15) 35%</td>
<td>(18) 42%</td>
<td>(23) 28%</td>
<td>(25) 21%</td>
<td>(38) 31%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>White/Non-Hispanic</td>
<td>(15) 35%</td>
<td>(15) 35%</td>
<td>(41) 50%</td>
<td>(46) 38%</td>
<td>(34) 28%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Native American Indian</td>
<td>(0)</td>
<td>(0)</td>
<td>(1) 1%</td>
<td>(0)</td>
<td>(1) 0.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Not Reported/Other</td>
<td>(0)</td>
<td>(0)</td>
<td>(1) 1%</td>
<td>(9) 8%</td>
<td>(16) 13%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Class of 2018
Class Profile
Residency

82% FL Residents
18% Non-FL Residents
Gender

50%  50%
Metrics

Average Age: 23
Age Range: 21-33
Mean GPA: 3.68
Mean MCAT: 31
Mean BCPM: 3.61
- Designed to increase the pipeline of talented URMs
- 8 week residential program that involves:
  - Research
  - Shadowing
  - Community Outreach
  - Classroom time
  - Meetings with distinguished faculty
  - Workshops and seminars on AMCAS application process
  - Informal MCAT Prep

**Cost: $4,000 per student**
Annual Wertheim Conference
The Temple Option
The Temple Option: Rationale

• National research and a growing literature continue to stress that High-School GPA best predicts college success.

• Temple’s research reflects national data.

• Test Optional supports President Theobald’s vision to provide access to affordable and excellent education to a diverse student body.
The Temple Option: Rationale

• Temple is the largest Northeast public research university offering a truly test-optional admissions alternative.

• A parallel academic scholarship program will positively affect our yield among first-generation, low-income, underrepresented, and, especially, Philadelphia and other urban students.

• Honors strongly supports test-optional in order to improve its diversity.
The Temple Option: Background

• Assembled a team of College of Education faculty to discuss using motivational and developmental (non-cognitive) attributes.

• Temple Staff included:
  
  • Two Senior Vice Provosts
  
  • The Director of Undergraduate Admissions
  
  • The Senior Advisor for Institutional Research and Assessment.
The Temple Option: Background

- Faculty identified 7 dimensions to be considered as critical factors associated with success:
  - Self-awareness
  - Self-concept
  - Self-Set Goals
  - Attributions (of success, of failure)
  - Coping Strategies
  - Self-authorship
  - Relevant experiences

- Drafted 8 short-answer essay questions.

- Field-tested questions with over 70 students at 7 area/suburban high schools.
The Temple Option: Secured University Approval

- Secured President’s and Provost’s endorsement to make the Temple Option the rationale for Temple’s APLU/USU Transformational Planning Grant proposal.

- Presented the Temple Option twice to Council of Deans in two-hour meetings.

- Circulated proposed questions to Deans for comment.

- Secured Deans’ approval.
The Temple Option: The Program

- Students choose to submit test scores or test optional on the application.
- Once the choice is made, it cannot be changed.
- Test-optional students access the four short-answer (100-150 words) questions via their student portal.
- Students are encouraged to answer in one sitting, but no effective time limit to the session.
The Temple Option: The Program

- Essays are read and scored by team of trained graduate students.

- Readers have only the essay to read, and have no other information about the student.

- Faculty team trains and monitors graduate readers.

- Scores are automatically recorded in Banner.

- Admissions counselors do not have access to a test-optional student’s short-answer essays during the application review.
The Temple Option: Continued Planning

• July-September
  -Continue pilot testing questions with RCC students and Honors students.
  
  -Establish minimum scores for admission into RCC, Emerging Scholars, and Honors Program.
  
  -Calibrate short-answer scores to accommodate access to merit scholarships.
  
  -Refine scoring protocol.
  
  -Test and refine Banner interface with scoring protocol.
Create training protocol and recruit grad readers.
The Temple Option: Continued Planning

• October-December

  - Score Early Action candidates.
  - Continue to sample essay scores to test for consistency among readers.
  - Conduct evaluative retreat for readers.
  - Score regular admission test-optional once Early Action is complete.
The Temple Option: Continued Planning

- January-May

  - Prepare research protocol on Early-Action depositors, and add in regular test-optional depositors.

  - Begin to compare placement exam results with test-optional scores and test-submitters.

  - Begin Year Two preparations, including refining test-optional short-answer questions, scoring, and grad reader training.
The Temple Option: Continued Planning

• June-July
  - Field test short answer essays in preparation for Year Two.
  - Refine student access to web-based short-answer interface.

• August
  - Launch Year Two of test-optional pilot.